

Improving Educational Quality (IEQ) Project

**AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY ON
SCHOOL LANGUAGE POLICY AND PRACTICE**

IEQ undertaken by:

American Institutes for Research

in collaboration with

**The Academy for Educational Development
Education Development Center, Inc.
Juárez and Associates, Inc.
The University of Pittsburgh**

Report prepared by:
Mercedeh Momeni

Prepared for:
**United States Agency for International Development
Washington, DC**

July 2000

Contract # HNE-I-00-97-00029-00

Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION.....	1
I. Bibliographies	1
II. Articles and Essays.....	2
III. Other Publications (books, reports, white papers, etc.).....	6

INTRODUCTION

This annotated bibliography consists of fifty-six items divided into three categories: bibliographies, articles and essays and, other publications. The entries date from 1975 to present. Although the majority of the entries were chosen with the school language policy and practice issue in mind, I have included some items that take into consideration other factors affecting education and language policy in various countries, in general.

I. BIBLIOGRAPHIES

1. Ballesteros, Ocatavio, A., *Bilingual-Bicultural Education*, Macfarland & Co., Jefferson, N.C., (1983). Contains annotated bibliographic chapters on: bilingual-bicultural education; first and second language teaching; bilingual students; teacher education and staff development; programs, curriculum, instruction and materials; language and linguistics; sociocultural and psychological perspectives; administration, counseling, testing and evaluation; references, textbooks and bibliographies. A total of 556 entries.
2. Brann, C.M.B., *Language in Education and Society in Nigeria: A Comparative Bibliography and Research Guide*, International Center for Research on Bilingualism, publication No. B-52, Quebec, (1975). Lists relevant journals and periodicals.
3. Devaki, L., et. al., *An Annotated Bibliography on Bilingualism, Bilingual Education and Medium of Instruction*, Central Institute of Indian Languages, Manasagangotri, Mysore, India, (1990). Contains 855 items published from 1950-1980. Some items of interest include: *Mother Tongue Education in West Africa*, by Timothy Awoniyi; *Mother Tongue Education: The West African Experience* by Ayo Bamgbose, "The Sociology of Bilingual Education" by Joshua Fishman in *Frontiers of Bilingual Education; Multilingualism and Multiculturalism: Britain and India* by Pattanayak, D.P.; and other publications by Robert Phillipson and Tove Skutnabb-Kangas.
4. *Dissertation Abstracts, 1971-1987*, The Center for International Education, (Jan. 1987), ERIC No. ED321594. This publication includes abstracts of all dissertations written by members of the Center for International Education at the University of Massachusetts. Dissertations include those which evolved from field experience in developing countries, including Ghana. Topics covered included, inter alia, education reform, education policy and education for development.
5. Fendras, Evangelos and Pianarosa, Albertina, *Child Bilingualism and Second Language Learning: A Descriptive Bibliography*, Les Presses De L'Universite Laval, Quebec (1975). Contains over 1600 entries, some of which concern the issue at hand in Africa. Indexed by languages, countries and peoples.

6. Westly, David, "Language and Education in Africa: A Select Bibliography, 1980-1990," *Comparative Education Review*, v. 36, n. 3, pp. 355- 367, (Aug. 1992). Along with approximately 140 items included in this bibliographic essay, Westly briefly outlines the historical development of education language policies in Africa.

II. ARTICLES AND ESSAYS

7. Adamson, Bob and Lai, Winnie A., "Language and Curriculum in Hong Kong: Dilemmas of Trigolssia," *Comparative Education*, v. 32 n., 2, pp. 233-246, (June 1997). This article focuses on "the impact of colonial transition [in Hong Kong] and in particular the emergence of Putonghua and on the language subjects in the primary and secondary school curricula in. It argues that whilst the rationale for promoting Putonghua is logical, tensions are evident in the school curricula," most notably in the areas of curricula heavily biased in favour of language subjects and the lack of expertise in this language.
8. Adekunle, Mobolaji A., "National Language Policy and Planning: The Nigerian Situation," *West African Journal of Modern Languages*, n. 1, pp. 23-29, (1976). The author argues for the development of a national policy for language planning. He considers the current education structure as it concerns language as a medium of instruction as well as a subject, as it effects the overall policy issue.
9. Arthur, Jo, "Institutional Practice and the Cultural Construction of Primary School Teaching in Botswana," *Comparative Education*, v. 34, n. 3, pp. 313-326 (Nov. 1998). This review is "based on a study which explores links between interactional order of the Botswana primary classroom and the wider social order, which includes highly centralised control of the education system Topics discussed within this context are the authority of teachers, the use of English as a symbol of that authority and the value placed on memorisation of knowledge for display."
10. Bayreuth African Studies Series 5, *Language and Education in Africa*, University of Bayreuth, Germany, (1986). Relevant articles include "Al-Hajj Sa'ad Umar Toure and Islamic Educational Reform in Mali" by Louis Brenner; "English in Tanzania" by Josef J. Schmied; and "Multilingualism and Language Policy in Sierra Leone."
11. Candelaria-Green, Jamie, "A Paradigm for Bilingual Special Education in the USA, Lessons From Kenya," *Bilingual Research Journal*, v. 20, n. 3, pp. 545-565, (fall 1996). This study concluded that "the Kenyan educational system in general promotes multilingualism among students with mental retardation."
12. Cleghorn, Allie, et. al., "Language Policy and Science Instruction in Kenyan Primary Schools," *Comparative Education Review*, v. 33, pp. 21-39, (Feb. 1989). The author discusses how the English language policy in Kenya affects teaching science to primary school children in that country.

13. Corson, David, "Towards a Comprehensive Language Policy: The Language of the School as a Second Language," *Education Canada*, v. 35 pp. 48-54, (summer 1995). This article discusses the need for a comprehensive language policy in Ontario, including recommendations on how to protect language rights through the education system.
14. Cummins, Jim, "Bilingual Education and English Immersion: The Ramirez Report in Theoretical Perspective," *Bilingual Research Journal*, v. 16, n. 1-2, pp. 91-104, (winter 1992). The findings of a U.S. Dept. of Education eight year study of bilingual education, called the Ramirez Report, "are discussed in a theoretical perspective. The report indicates that Latino students who receive sustained first language instruction throughout elementary school have better academic prospects than those who received most or all their instruction in English."
15. Flood, James, et. al., "Literacy Instruction for Students: Moving Beyond the Immersion Debate," *Reading Teacher*, v. 50, n. 4, pp. 356-359, (Dec. 1996 - Jan. 1997). The authors outline the controversy that surrounds second language education in the U.S. and attempt to dispel and challenge some myths attached to this issue.
16. Genesee, Fred, et. al., "Three Elementary School Alternatives for Learning Through a Second Language," *Modern Language Journal*, v. 73, n. 3, pp. 250-263, (autumn 1989). The article discusses three approaches to teaching a second language.
17. Gersten, Russell, "The Changing Face of Bilingual Education," *Educational Leadership*, v. 56, n. 7, pp. 41-45, (Apr. 1999). This article analyzes why the questions of: At what age is it best to introduce academic instruction in English to young students?; To what extent - if any - does native language instruction benefit students' cognitive and academic growth?; and, Which are the best instructional methods for developing English language proficiency? have not been fully answered after much research, by others, on the subject.
18. Gfeller, Elisabeth and Robinson, Clinton, "Which Language for Teaching? Cultural Messages Transmitted by the Languages Used In Education," *Language and Education*, v. 12, n. 1, pp. 18-32, (1998) (ERIC No. EJ564085). The question of mother-tongue education of young children in francophone African countries is examined.
19. Grant, Sydney R., "Toward Identity and Community in Namibia and the United States: A Disturbing Contrast," *Social Studies*, v. 87, n. 2, pp. 68-71, (Mar. 1996). A comparison of the educational systems of Namibia and the U.S., with a focus on reform movements and each country's language policy and practice.
20. Hawkes, Nicolas, "The Medium of Instruction in Primary Schools in Ghana," *West African Journal of Modern Languages*, n.1, pp. 57-65, (1976). The writer explores the question "Do young children, exposed to English-medium schooling from their first or second school year, in fact reach a higher level of attainment in English by the end of the Primary course than those who have learnt it only as a subject, in the circumstances obtaining, textbooks and the English-as-a-subject course being the same for both groups?"

21. Jessop, Tansy and Penny, Allen, "A Study of Teacher Voice and Vision in the Narratives of Rural South African and Gambian Primary School Teachers," *International Journal of Educational Development*, v. 18, n. 5, pp. 393 - 403, (Sept. 1998). The authors seek to understand to what extent teachers in rural South Africa and Gambia claimed ownership over what they taught, to whom, how and for what reason.

22. Koshewa, Allen, "Linguistic Minorities in Multilingual Settings," *Bilingual Research Journal*, v. 20 n. 3-4, pp.663-666, (summer 1996). Koshewa's review of the book *Linguistic Minorities in Multilingual Settings* by Christina Bratt Paulston (Philadelphia: John Benjamins, (1994)) states, Paulston contends that "language policies that counter the tide of sociocultural trends are, at best, ineffective." Paulston also argues that "the varying degrees of success achieved by the language policies in [various] countries are directly related the degree to which social factors of language maintenance and shift were considered."

23. Lara-Alecio, Rafael and Parker Richard I., "A Pedagogical Model for Transitional English Bilingual Classrooms," *Bilingual Research Journal*, v. 18, n. 3-4, pp. 119-133, (summer 1994). "A pedagogical model for transitional English bilingual classrooms is developed to meet the goals of teacher training and guidance, program evaluation and empirical validation of bilingual theories."

24. Mazuri, Alamin, "The World Bank, the Language Question and the Future of African Education," *Race and Class*, v. 38, n. 3, pp. 35-48, (Jan. 1997). The author asserts that in the school language policy debate in Africa, the World Bank has "put in its vote for English, which is a move that is at odds with its stated policy."

25. Mda, Thobeka V., "Issues in the Making of South Africa's Language in Education Policy," *Journal of Negro Education*, v. 66, n. 4, pp. 336-375, (fall 1997). The writer argues that "to be truly understood, [South Africa's] Language in Education Policy must be examined in the context of both historical and recent developments in South African society." The author considers the assumptions on which the policy is based and its goals, factors inhibiting the implementation of the Policy and offers recommendations for future focus and actions.

26. Ngonyani, Deo, "The Failure of Language Policy in Tanzanian Schools," *Social Education*, v. 61 n. 7, pp. 412-418, (Nov. 1997). Ngonyani asserts that "Tanzania's language policy in education, formulated in 1960 from the British colonial education system is no longer consonant with present realities because English is no longer an effective medium in secondary schools." He further contends that ". . . the language problem is symptomatic of the larger crisis of neglected education system in Tanzania and that Kiswahili has become the scapegoat for declining standards of education."

27. Peacock, Allen, "An Agenda for Research on Text Material in Primary Science for Second Language Learners of English in Developing Countries," *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, v. 16, n. 5, (1995). "[R]eadability and comprehensibility of text material for learning science in primary schools, which shows that text are often too difficult for children, particularly in developing countries where pupils are learning through a medium of instruction which is not their first language" is reviewed.
28. Pryor, John, "Action Research in West African Schools: Problems and Prospects," *International Journal of Educational Development*, v. 18, n.3, pp. 219-228, (1998). Pryor reviews "the need for the appropriate research methodology for investigating Ghanaian education by reference to some of the literature" and then evaluates "the claims of action research in this respect."
29. Pryor, John and Akwesi, Christian, "Assessment in Ghana and England: Putting Reform to the Test of Practice," *Compare*, v. 28, n. 3, pp. 263-275, (Oct. 1998). The article "[o]utlines participatory research projects that assess the problem of teachers' conception of assessment as barriers to improvement in assessment reform in Ghana and England."
30. Ravitch, Diane, " Student Performance," *Brookings Review*, v. 17, n. 1, pp. 12-16, (winter 1999). The author seeks to analyze U.S. federal education policy, including bilingual education. She claims that the program has failed in its mission due largely to the preponderance of bilingual classes being offered in Spanish and not in English.
31. Rollnick, Marissa et. al., "A Model for Studying Gaps in Education: A Swaziland Case Study in the Learning of Science," *International Journal of Educational Development*, v. 18, n. 6, pp. 453-466, (Nov. 1998). The authors "develop a model to provide a holistic analysis of educational gaps. A Swazi case study presented is used to illustrate the use of the model."
32. Rueda, Robert and Garcia, Erminda, "Teachers' Perspectives on Literacy Assessment and Instruction with Language Minority Students: A Comparative Study," *Elementary School Journal*, v. 96, n. 3, p. 311-332, (Jan. 1996). The article considers the varying views of teachers, especially those involved in bilingual education, on the issue of assessment.
33. Schrag, Peter, "Language Barrier," *New Republic*, v. 218, n. 19, pp. 14-15, (Mar. 9, 1998). Discusses bilingual education in the context of California Proposition 227 and comments on the National Science Foundations' study of bilingual education, which concluded that native language instruction can be "helpful."
34. Smolicz, Jerzy and Nical, Illuminado, "Exploring the European Idea of a National Language: Some Educational Implications of the Use of English and Indigenous Languages in the Philippines," *International Review of Education*, v. 43, n. 5-6, pp. 507-526, (1997). A study on the problem facing approximately two-thirds of the population of the Philippines who do not have English or Filipino (the languages of instruction in that country) as their first or home language.

35. Sure, Kembo, "Bilingual Education on an Uneven Playfield: The Kenyan Case," *Journal of Third World Studies*, v. 16, n. 1, pp. 147-163, (spring 1999). Sure argues that "... the [Kenyan] language policy in education is promoting the use and acceptance of English at the expense of the indigenous Kenyan languages," which will cause an "irreversible weakening of the Kenyan languages and eventually a massive language-shift situation." Therefore, he proposes the remedy consists of "the extension of the mother-tongue instruction to, say, end of primary education in at least some of the school subjects;" and the expansion of the use of indigenous languages in the provision of government services.
36. Sure, Kembo, "Linguistic Standardization and State Rationalization in Kenya: A Move Towards Nation-Building," *Journal of Third World Studies*, v. 15, n. 1, pp. 185-203, (spring 1998). The diminished use of native languages in Kenya will have negative and grave consequences for its citizenry. One solution, he asserts, is to ensure prolonged use of the mother-tongue in primary education.
37. Tully, Mark, "English, An Advantage to India?" *ELT Journal*, v. 51, p. 157-64, (Apr. 1997). An edited version of a lecture by Tully presented in 1996 is published in this Journal. Tully asserts that "the use of English adversely affects India's economic development because those with the influence to improve education send their children to English-medium schools and have no interest in the education provided to the masses in schools through local languages." In his conclusion, the author offers remedies to this problem.
38. Valdes, Guadalupe, "Dual-language Immersion Programs: A Cautionary Note Concerning the Education of Language-Minority Students," *Harvard Educational Review*, v. 67, n. 3, pp. 391-429, (fall 1997). "After reviewing the literature on the success and failure of Mexican-origin children, the author raises difficult questions surrounding the use of duallanguage [sic] immersion in the education of language minority students."
39. Valdes, Gudalupe, "The World Outside and Inside Schools: Language and Immigrant Children," *Educational Researcher*, v. 27, n. 6, pp. 4-18 (Aug-Sept 1998). Uses case study to examine policy and instructional dilemmas that surround the education of immigrant children in the U.S.

III. OTHER PUBLICATIONS (BOOKS, TECHNICAL REPORTS, WHITE PAPERS, ETC.)

40. Ando-Kumi, Kingsley, *Language Education Policies in Ghana*, CRiGLE, Accra, Ghana, (1997). "This book is a study of language education policies in Ghana, with particular reference to the role of Ghanaian Languages in the education of the Ghanaian child." It examines the language education policies that "have been promulgated since formal classroom education was introduced in" Ghana.

41. Bezanson, Keith and Hawkes, Nicolas, *Bilingual Reading Skills of Primary School Children in Ghana*, Working Papers on Bilingualism, No. 11, (1976). ERIC No. ED129077. Study conducted in the primary schools of Ghana demonstrated that “the nature of [a] child’s bilingual experience, especially in the classroom, may be a far more important determinant of reading ability than the degree of oral proficiency attained, since the children in this study obtained similar mean reading scores in the two languages.”
42. Brown, David, *Educational Policy and the Choice of Language in Linguistically Complex South African Schools: Formative Decision-Making by Significant Language Professionals and Governing Bodies*, Education Policy Unit, Natal, South Africa, (1998). ERIC No. ED427549. This research report examined a 1996 South African law, and its implementation, which vested elementary and secondary school governing bodies with formation of school policy concerning both languages used for instruction. The report findings highlights the policy’s shortcomings.
43. Center on African Studies, Seminar Proceedings No. 26, *Language In Education In Africa*. This publication contains the seminar proceedings held at the University of Edingburgh in Nov. 1985, (1985). Papers presented include, but are not limited to: “Language Planning and Education Change” by Gibson Ferguson; “Authenticity and Problems of Language Planning in Zaire” by B. Nthawakuderwa; “Using the English Medium in African Schools” by Rod Ellis; “Patterns of Language Use Among Tanzanian Secondary School Pupils 1970: A Benchmark” by Peter Hill; “Multilingualism and some of its Implications for Language Policy and Practices in Kenya” by K. wa’Njoroge; “Strains and Conflicts in Planning for Teacher Education for English Language Teaching in the Namibian Context” by David Carver; “Research Issues and Perspectives in Language in Education in Africa: An Agenda for the Next Decade” by Anna Obura.
44. Cenoz, Jasone and Genesee, Fred (eds.), *Beyond Bilingualism: Multilingualism and Multilingual Education*, Multilingual Matters Series, Tayler and Francis, Levittown, PA, (1998). ERIC No. 427539. This collection of essays on multilingual education includes: “A Global Perspective on Multilingualism and Multilingual Education” by G. Richard Tucker; “Curriculum Decision-Making in Content-Based Language Teaching” by Myriam Met; “Immersion Pedagogy and Implications for Language Teaching” by Roy Lister; “Teaching in Two or More Languages in The Philippine Context” by Andrew Gonzalez; “Indigenous Multilingualism and Education in Peru and Bolivia” by Nancy Hornberger and Luis Enrique Lopez; and “Eritrea: Developing a Programme of Multilingual Education” by Nadine Dutchner.
45. Chaturvedi, M.G. and Mohale, B.V., *Position of Language in School Curriculum in India*, National Council of Educational Research and Training, New Delhi, India, (1976). The study assesses the “position of language instruction at different stages of school education in all the states and union territories in India.” Chapter 3.4 considers bilingualism in India while Chapter 4 examines education and language policy of India.

46. Gbedemah, F.F.K., *Alternatives Language Policies for Education in Ghana*, Vantage Press, New York, N.Y., (1975). The author investigates “ the attitudes of a group of educators toward the educational value of local languages in relation to the continued use of the English language.” His (her?) study revealed, inter alia, that the “group favoured a multilingual education policy for Ghana. Strong and wide support was given to the English language.” (Author’s Note).
47. Gunn, Geoffrey C., *Language, Power and Ideology in Brunei Darussalam*, Ohio University Center for International Studies, (1997). The author covers, among others, the topic of language policy, language instruction and education at all levels, in Brunei.
48. Luckett, Kathy, *Additive Bilingualism: New Models of Language Education for South African Schools*, English Teaching Information Center, Johannesburg, South Africa, (1992). This working paper, reports from the Medium of Instruction Sub-group to the Language Policy Research group of the National Education Policy Investigation. It provides a historical overview of the school language policy of South Africa from 1652 to the present day. It also incorporates the comparative perspective from other multilingual countries in its conclusion.
49. Richmond, Edmun B., *New Directions in Language Teaching in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Seven-Country Study of Current Policies and Programs for Teaching Official and National Languages and Adult Functional Literacy*, University Press of America, Washington, D.C., (1983). The author investigates the policies in language and literacy teaching in seven multilinguistic countries of sub-Saharan Africa -- both Franco and Anglophone -- and concludes with recommendations addressing the problematic assumptions on which the policies are base.
50. Roy-Campbell, Zaline M., *Empowerment through language: The African Experience in Tanzania and Beyond*, Africa World Press, Trenton, N.J., (1999). The author examines the native language and the education policies of Tanzania in the African context and evaluates the language policy of that country.
51. Skutnaab-Kangas, Tove, et. al. (eds.), *Linguistic Human Rights: Overcoming linguistic discrimination*, Mouton de Gruyter, Berlin (1994). Chapters attached:
- “Combining immigrant and autochtonous language rights: a territorial approach to multilingualism” by Francois Grin
- “On the limits of ethnolinguistic democracy” by Joshua A. Fishman
- “Language policy in the United States: a history of cultural genocide” by Eduardo Hernanadez-Chavez
- “The discourse of disinformation: the debate on bilingual education and language rights in the Untied States” by Jim Cummins

“Language rights in postcolonial Africa” by Robert Phillipson - Tove Skutnabb-Kangas

An appendix includes extracts from selected UN and regional agreements covering linguistic human rights, proposals for such, and resolutions on language rights. Includes bibliographic references and index.

52. Stephens, David, *Girls and Basic Education: A Cultural Enquiry*. Department for International Development, Education Division, Education Research Serial No. 23, London, (1998). This study examines the issues and experiences of 89 women teachers, head teachers and girls in and out of school in two contrasting Ghanaian cultural contexts. The topics of primary education and literacy are also examined.
53. Ubadigbo, Fidelis N., *English as a Second Language: An Educational Overview for Multicultural and Bilingual West African Students*, ERIC No. ED410748 (1996). This paper presented at the 10th Annual English as a Second Language/Bilingual Conference, discusses “cultural and education characteristics of West African countries that may have implications for West Africans studying in the United States,” by outlining the structures of the systems of elementary and other schools in West African countries, including Ghana. “Charts detailing the structures of the Nigerian and U.S. systems of education are provided for comparison and some comparisons are made with the U.S. within the text.”
54. UNESCO, *African Community Languages and Their Use in Literacy and Education: A Regional Survey*, UNESCO Regional Office for Education in Africa, Dakar, (March 1985). A survey of African languages with maps and lists of relevant community languages and principal institutions involved in or responsible for African language research.
55. The World Bank’s Education and Training Department’s Research Division, *Financing Education in Developing Countries*, The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/ The World Bank, Washington, D.C. (1986). Contains tables such as “annual expenditure per primary school pupil in 1970 and 1980 for developing countries,” including Ghana and “repetition and survival rates in primary schooling.”
56. The World Bank’s Africa Regional Office/Western Africa Department, *Ghana 2000 and Beyond, Setting the Stage for Accelerated Growth and Poverty Reduction*. The World Bank, Washington, D.C., (Feb. 1993). Chapter 3 of this study provides information on “investing in people,” with a sub-section on education.